

The City had two non-price priorities: the outreach plan and the wind performance. Three firms were disqualified for not meeting the wind spec. One firm had a reference which praise their product highly for performance in windy conditions (OTTO); it should be noted that firm is also the most expensive of the proposers, and not by a negligible amount. The other priority was the outreach plan. One proposer (Cascade) had be far a superior proposal to the other two proposers. This firm has the second-best pricing, and the difference between it and the lowest price was (less than \$34,000 on a roughly \$3 million purchase).

Scores

	Cascade	IPL	OTTO	Rehrig	Schafer	Toter
KV	8.29	6.71	7.41	0	0	0
CR	7.45	6.78	6.00	0	0	0

Notes

- Rehrig, Schafer, and Toter disqualified on wind performance of carts—i.e., unacceptable product.
- Cascade, IPL, and OTTO are responsive proposers (complete and of high quality) with acceptable products (meeting required specifications). Some notes differentiating their proposals:
 - On price alone, IPL scores slightly higher than Cascade—i.e., price is slightly lower, with initial purchase price \$33,820.60 less for IPL versus Cascade. OTTO is markedly more expensive, at \$185,033.50 more than Cascade and \$218,854.10 more than IPL.
 - IPL is the heaviest cart, both pounds of resin per cart and assembled weight; OTTO is the lightest on both counts.
 - Cascade has by far the best proposal for outreach. IPL and Otto provide very little detail and reply on one mailing with an undefined mail-back or phone call system for responses. IPL recommended a completely different approach (swap-out instead of pre-ordering) but still did not provide detailed description of their recommended alternative. Cascade had a detailed and innovative plan, described creating unique web sites; a phone number; mail-back; and SMS messaging for customers to respond.
- One OTTO reference (Sacramento, CA) went out of their way to contact GBB and recommend them. Spoke glowingly of OTTO as a vendor, and also addressed performance in windy conditions. Sacramento is a very windy place, much like Broken Arrow, and the reference said OTTO is the only product they have ever been happy with.

Scoresheets

Proposal Evaluation Form	FILL IN THESE FIELDS	Cascade		IPL		OTTO		Rehrig		Schafer		Toter	
City of Broken Arrow													
Project C200050	Kate S. Vasquez, GBB	27-Mar-20											
Evaluation Summaries													
This sheet tallies scores from the other sheets. DO NOT enter values below this point!!!													
SUMMARY OF EVALUATION CRITERIA GRADING AND RANKING													
Checklist Criteria		Cascade		IPL		OTTO		Rehrig		Schafer		Toter	
Evaluation Criteria	Criteria Weighting	Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score
0. Completeness	0%	10.00	0.00	10.00	0.00	10.00	0.00	10.00	0.00	10.00	0.00	10.00	0.00
Total	0%		0.00		0.00		0.00		0.00		0.00		0.00
Evaluation Criteria		Cascade		IPL		OTTO		Rehrig		Schafer		Toter	
Evaluation Criteria	Criteria Weighting	Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score
1. Firm Qualifications	10%	9.20	0.92	7.80	0.78	8.70	0.87	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
2. Overall Price	35%	9.07	3.18	9.13	3.19	8.62	3.02	8.83	3.09	10.00	3.50	9.53	3.33
3. Outreach and Cart Selection Plan	35%	9.60	3.36	7.10	2.49	7.10	2.49	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
4. Quality of the Cart	20%	4.17	0.83	1.25	0.25	5.21	1.04	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
Raw Total	100%		8.29		6.71		7.41		3.09		3.50		3.33
Total Weighted Score (out of 10)			8.29		6.71		7.41		0.00		0.00		0.00

Proposal Evaluation Form	FILL IN THESE FIELDS	Cascade		IPL		OTTO		Rehrig		Schafer		Toter	
City of Broken Arrow													
Project C200050	Corinne Rico, GBB Inc.	27-Mar-20											
Evaluation Summaries													
This sheet tallies scores from the other sheets. DO NOT enter values below this point!!!													
SUMMARY OF EVALUATION CRITERIA GRADING AND RANKING													
Checklist Criteria		Cascade		IPL		OTTO		Rehrig		Schafer		Toter	
Evaluation Criteria	Criteria Weighting	Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score
0. Completeness	0%	10.00	0.00	10.00	0.00	10.00	0.00	10.00	0.00	10.00	0.00	10.00	0.00
Total	0%		0.00		0.00		0.00		0.00		0.00		0.00
Evaluation Criteria		Cascade		IPL		OTTO		Rehrig		Schafer		Toter	
Evaluation Criteria	Criteria Weighting	Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score
1. Firm Qualifications	10%	7.15	0.72	5.40	0.54	5.78	0.58	4.20	0.42	7.05	0.71	8.08	0.81
2. Overall Price	35%	9.07	3.18	9.13	3.19	8.62	3.02	8.83	3.09	10.00	3.50	9.53	3.33
3. Outreach and Cart Selection Plan	35%	7.80	2.73	8.00	2.80	3.90	1.37	4.10	1.44	5.10	1.79	5.85	2.05
4. Quality of the Cart	20%	4.17	0.83	1.25	0.25	5.21	1.04	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
Raw Total	100%		7.45		6.78		6.00		4.95		5.99		6.19
Total Weighted Score (out of 10)			7.45		6.78		6.00		0.00		0.00		0.00