



City of Broken Arrow
Minutes
Broken Arrow Municipal Authority

City Hall
220 S 1st Street
Broken Arrow OK
74012

Chairperson Craig Thurmond
Vice Chair Scott Eudey
Trustee Johnnie Parks
Trustee Debra Wimpee
Trustee Christi Gillespie

Tuesday, September 17, 2019

Council Chambers

1. Call to Order

Chairperson Craig Thurmond called the meeting to order at approximately 7:04 p.m.

2. Roll Call

Present: 5 - Christi Gillespie, Debra Wimpee, Johnnie Parks, Scott Eudey, Craig Thurmond

3. Consideration of Consent Agenda

- A. 19-42 Approval of the Broken Arrow Municipal Authority Meeting Minutes of September 3, 2019**
- B. 19-1121 Acknowledgement of submittal of the Broken Arrow Municipal Authority's Water Supply Report for the month of July 2019**
- C. 19-1189 Acknowledgement of receipt of Oklahoma Department of Environmental Quality (ODEQ) Permit No. WL000072190656 for the relocation of the Garnett Water Line**
- D. 19-1093 Approval of and authorization to execute an Amendment to the Professional Consultant Agreement with Tetra Tech, Inc. for Lynn Lane Secondary Clarifier Rehabilitation (Project No. 165422)**
- E. 19-1037 Approval of and authorization to execute a Professional Consultant Agreement with Holloway, Updike, and Bellen, Inc. (HUB) for Adams Creek Northwest Lift Station Improvements**
- F. 18-1460 Ratification of the Claims list dated 09/13/2019**

Chairperson Thurmond asked if there were any items to be removed from the Consent Agenda. There were none.

MOTION: A motion was made by Scott Eudey, seconded by Debra Wimpee.

Move to approve the Consent Agenda

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Christi Gillespie, Debra Wimpee, Johnnie Parks, Scott Eudey, Craig Thurmond

4. Consideration of Items Removed from Consent Agenda

There were no Items removed from the Consent Agenda. No action was required or taken.

5. Public Hearings, Appeals, Presentations, Recognitions, Awards

- A. 19-1188 Presentation, discussion, and possible acceptance of the Broken Arrow Pilot Project Report and recommendation of the Citizen Recycle Committee Report**

Ms. Kate Vasquez, GBB Solid Waste Consultant, reported she had been working with Broken Arrow for the past several years on the Recycling Project. She noted there was a lot of information to review, but she wished to ensure there was clear understanding. She reviewed a slide which illustrated how the project progressed from 2016 until today, beginning with a

scientific resident telephone survey, appointment of the Citizen's Recycling Committee, pilot program development, pilot program conduction and results review. She briefly discussed the scientific survey results which indicated residents enjoyed the current sanitary service, but were open to change and were interested in recycling. She noted there were mixed feelings regarding cart usage.

Ms. Kate Vasquez with GBB Solid Waste Consultant reviewed the actions of the Recycling Committee which met nine times, went on field trips, learned the material and discussed the subject thoughtfully and intensively. She reported the Recycling Committee recommended the pilot program, once a week trash pickup, and discontinuation of bag distribution.

She reported the next step was Pilot Program planning: Staff thoughtfully chose the two pilot areas, C2Logix planned the recycling routes, carts were purchased, trucks were retrofitted to lift the carts, a professional outreach campaign was developed, audits were organized with Tulsa Refuse and Transfer, and a resident participant survey was developed to collect meaningful data throughout the Pilot Program. She displayed maps of the pilot program areas. She displayed and discussed the outreach materials which were used.

Ms. Vasquez reviewed the pilot program results. She reported pilot participation rate was almost 100% (percentage of residents who accepted carts) and set out rate was approximately 50% (percentage of residents who set out the cart on any given day). She reviewed the recycling rate and noted the recycling rate was 20% which was good. She reviewed and discussed the recycling "pounds per set out" graph. She stated two Tulsa Refuse and Transfer Audits were done, one in March 2019 and one in May 2019. She reviewed and discussed the Audit Results which noted contamination in the Thursday two-cart system tripled over time, while the one-cart had only a small increase in contamination. She displayed and discussed photos of contamination and noted these were educational; the information could be used to determine the type of education materials which needed to be distributed. She explained contamination would improve with public education. She displayed and discussed some photos of the pilot program in action.

Ms. Vasquez reported Shapard Research conducted three surveys of the pilot participants. She noted approximately two thirds of the survey participants responded by telephone and one third responded by email. She noted overall participants were positive about the pilot experience: 86.5% reported recycling something every week, 39.7% reported setting out carts weekly, 38.3% reported a wish for a smaller cart, 51% reported they did not want a smaller cart, 68.1% reported less trash production due to recycling, 70% reported never having gone to the Met to recycle, 88.7% reported a belief that recycling was important for the community, and 86.5% reported satisfaction with the pilot recycling service. She reviewed the survey results regarding the amount of trash and recycling which participants set out; most participants felt the single recycling cart was of sufficient capacity. She reported in the two-cart pilot 63% indicated a preference for carts over bags and 33% indicated a bag preference, while 8% had difficulty physically handling the cart. She reported in the one-cart pilot 76.6% were in favor of the recycling cart, 14.8% were not in favor of the cart, and 6% had difficulty handling the cart. She noted when the one-cart participants were asked if they would like to have a second cart for trash 43% responded yes and 54% responded no. She reported 62.4% of participants used the provided tote for collecting recyclables and 58.2% were aware of the recycleba.org website. She reported younger residents participated at slightly higher rates and newer residents had the strongest preference for carts over bags; there was no difference in income band or household size participation rates.

Ms. Vasquez reported recycling processing costs had changed in the past three years. She discussed the changes which affected these cost changes. She reported currently there was a market for glass recycling and residents wished to recycle glass; therefore, GBB recommended

including glass in the curbside program. She reviewed and discussed several questions the Recycling Committee asked, including questions about opting out, the Met, and once a week pickup. She reported if a resident did not wish to have a recycling cart, most municipalities would remove the recycling carts, but there was never a rate adjustment associated with a voluntary opt-out. She reported Mr. Brannin (of the Met) indicated a curbside recycling program would not hurt the Met in any way. She noted most municipalities practiced once a week pickup.

She reported currently there were approximately nine residents in Broken Arrow who required accommodation for trash pickup. She stated she believed the number of residents who would require accommodation with the carts would be higher; however, this number would remain in the single digit percentage. She noted there were many different options for accommodation; the City would need to review and discuss the possible options. She reported there were smaller cart options; however, the truck lift could not accommodate a cart smaller than 64 gallons. She reviewed and discussed the accommodation options including front door/garage door service and side door/back door service. She noted the front door/garage door service was the easiest for workers as workers would not have to walk around behind a home to see if the cart was set out for pickup.

Mr. Russell Peterson, Chairperson of the Citizen's Recycling Committee, reviewed some of the topics which were discussed by the Committee including worker's compensation issues, City sanitation employment difficulties, leasing versus purchasing carts, recycling opt-out, etc. He reported the Citizen's Recycling Committee recommended: 1) Convert the entire City to once a week collection via rerouting. 2) Issue all customers a 96 gallon blue recycling cart with the option to opt-out. 3) Continue collection of garbage and yard waste in bags with a reduction in bag vouchers by 50%. 4) Continue to replenish truck fleet with automated trucks for collecting recyclables. 5) Within three years implement trash carts and eliminate the bag program. He noted the Recycling Committee believed this was the best method of implementing a City wide Recycling program.

Trustee Wimpee asked about the bag voucher statistics. Mr. Lee Zirk responded at any given time about 60% of vouchers were redeemed; this percentage has remained consistent over the years. He noted bags were ordered according to the expected redemption rate.

Vice Chair Eudey asked if there was resident frustration regarding inability to redeem bag vouchers at stores. He stated he understood fewer stores were stocking the bags. Mr. Zirk responded there was some frustration; however, the percentage of residents who redeemed the vouchers was still 60%. He noted it was a challenge to ensure the stores stocked enough of the product for residents. He discussed some of the efforts being made in this regard. City Manager Spurgeon asked about the cost of the bags. Mr. Zirk responded he was unsure; he believed the bags were approximately \$3 dollars per roll. Assistant City Manager Russell Gale reported this year \$620,000 dollars had been budgeted for the bag voucher program. Lee Zirk noted bag cost had risen.

Trustee Parks asked if there was difficulty with subpar bags being used for trash set out. Mr. Zirk responded in the affirmative; it was difficult when a poor quality bag was used and broke during pickup.

Trustee Wimpee asked how yard waste would be addressed with the two cart system. Mr. Zirk stated residents would be instructed yard waste could be placed inside the trash cart; if there was no room inside the cart, the yard waste could be set beside the cart.

Ms. Kate Vasquez reported C2Logix developed a collection route program for the entire City of Broken Arrow including the estimated cost to run the routes. She reviewed the assumptions

used to create this collection route program: once weekly pickup, 96 gallon carts, "single side" or "dual pass" collection, transition to automated side-loading trucks, and a comprehensive outreach program. She explained the "single side" or "dual pass" collection method allowed a truck to drive up one side of the street and then back down the other for cart pickup, enabled one worker to ride on the back of the truck rather than two, and was generally much safer for workers. She noted once trucks were fully automated only a driver would be needed for cart pickup. She reviewed the results of the Resource Estimator. She reported Broken Arrow would need a fleet of approximately 18 trucks plus spare trucks. She reviewed the potential costs and savings of the new sanitation program. She stated there were estimated savings in labor force; temporary labor would not be needed. She indicated the savings would not be generated by firing employees; the City was currently short staffed and generally any reduction in staff would be accomplished over time through attrition. She reported there would be an increase in processing costs. She reported there would be significant savings in the bag voucher cost. She reported there would be a cost to amortize the carts. She reported rerouting and single side pickup would provide a cost savings as well.

Ms. Vasquez noted several decisions needed to be made: would recycling cart use be initiated immediately; would a one-cart or two-cart system be initiated; and if a two-cart system was chosen would the trash carts be transitioned in or implemented immediately. She noted GBB did not recommend implementation of once a week pickup without implementation of some sort of cart. She noted there were residents in the one-cart pilot program which complained about storing garbage bags in the garage for a week prior to pickup who requested a cart for trash storage.

Ms. Vasquez noted GBB's original recommendation was to start with a one cart system and then in the future add the garbage cart. She explained this was due to data support and due to this being the recycling system which could be most quickly implemented with the least amount of startup cost. She stated the biggest operational challenge was storage of trash bags during the week; residents might self-purchase carts for garbage storage and non-standard containers would affect collection operations and optimization. She noted this recommendation would require continued bag vouchers and the cost associated, there was increased risk of vectors, and if residents used non-standard containers then collection time would slow.

She reported after discussion with the Recycling Committee the GBB conclusions were: 1) There remained strong interest in Recycling. 2) Most of the problems with the two-cart system could be addressed with a more responsive and intensive education program than was provided during the pilot program. 3) Despite differences in startup costs, the operational costs of a two-cart system and a one-cart system were virtually identical. 4) With the efficiencies gained from rerouting, from once weekly collection and from reduced bag purchase costs, per unit sanitation costs should remain stable even with the addition of a new recycling service (this was true for both a one-cart or two-cart system). 5) The recommendation from the Citizen's Recycling Committee was sound from an operational standpoint and could be accomplished in a three year timeframe.

Trustee Parks commended Ms. Vasquez and the GBB for being knowledgeable and accommodating. He noted this particular committee had been a very long commitment. He stated City Manager Spurgeon had indicated the Broken Arrow Sanitation System was not sustainable. He explained Broken Arrow had problems with workers compensation claims and experienced difficulties hiring new employees; workers did not wish to pick up trash bags all day long. He stated changes were necessary to make the Broken Arrow Sanitation System sustainable once again. He stated the recommendation of the Committee to the Authority was unanimously agreed upon by the Committee.

Vice Chair Eudey stated as the Committee Alternate he did not vote. He commended Ms. Vasquez and GBB, and thanked the Committee participants. He stated he served as the City's Trustee on the Met and did not wish the Met to suffer as a result of curbside recycling. He reported the Broken Arrow Met facility was routinely the busiest and most productive facility in the entire Met system. He stated the City would continue to support the Met after institution of curbside recycling; the Met was highly valuable and recycled materials not supported by the curbside recycling system. He noted he felt a few public meetings to hear resident feedback about the program would be beneficial. He stated he received equal amounts of emails from residents who wished for no change at all and residents who wished for drastic change to a two cart system.

Trustee Parks noted the recycling program was completely voluntary; residents would not be forced to recycle. He noted if residents consistently put contaminated materials into recycling carts, the carts could be removed from the residence.

Trustee Gillespie agreed with both Trustee Parks and Vice Chair Eudey. She stated change was inevitable. She reported most communities only had once weekly pickup; twice weekly pickup was very rare. She stated while it was nice to put trash on the curb and have it gone when you came home from work, if it was not a sustainable program then changes needed to be made.

Vice Chair Eudey stated he believed the sanitation system was unsustainable due to the difficulty of hiring and keeping employees, as well as increased workers compensation claims. He stated knowing the City was having difficulty keeping employees, and was continuously required to hire temporary workers who did not have the same rigorous background checks as City employees, and who would quit mid-route, he was afraid there was no way to sustain the current sanitation system. He stated it was important to have a plan in place to bring the sanitation system into sustainability and it was important to consider all options.

Trustee Wimpee stated when change was necessary it was important for the Community to be educated regarding the reasons for the necessary change.

City Manager Spurgeon reported the three core services Broken Arrow provided the Citizens were trash, water and streets. He stated the governing body, Broken Arrow Municipal Authority, should be deliberate in its decision making. He recommended BAMA accept the report and hold a City Council Workshop for reviewing the GBB Report in more detail and to hold public discussion. He reported currently sanitation workers oftentimes were forced to work until 8 p.m. or later, in 90 degree weather, picking up trash, due to a lack of sanitation workers. He stated he felt this was unacceptable and Broken Arrow residents needed to understand the challenges associated with the current sanitation system. He stated he hoped to communicate these challenges to the residents.

Trustee Parks asked Staff to create a summarized fact sheet which could be provided to the Citizens. Trustee Gillespie suggested holding the Workshop Meeting as soon as possible.

Chairperson Thurmond noted there were two individuals who signed up in opposition of this Item who did not wish to speak.

Citizen Valerie Coble stated her address was 2005 W. Decatur Street, Broken Arrow. She stated she participated in the one-cart pilot program and had been assigned Friday pickup. She noted she discovered most trash was created on the weekend and as such she was forced to store trash for six days in the garage. She noted storing the trash in the garage for this length of time attracted rodents. She stated even if she were given a trash cart her grass clippings would not fit inside a trash cart and would continue to require garage storage. She stated she

worried residents who did not have large garages would be required to store grass clippings outside of the home which would be unattractive. She noted being forced to once a week pickup and being limited to 10 bags per pickup was unfair given residents with twice weekly pickup were permitted 20 bags per week (10 bags per pickup). She stated if pickup was permanently switched to once weekly the bag limit should be increased to accommodate lawn clippings. She asked about overflow pickup if a cart system was used, especially for bundled branches, Christmas trees, grass clippings, etc. She stated if the City refused to pick up these types of items residents would begin dumping trash in ditches. She stated she felt sanitation rates should be cut in half if pickup was only done half the time. She stated she worried the sanitation rates would go up to accommodate recycling implementation. She recommended the City stop the bag voucher program to save funds. She recommended dedicating trash pickup to Monday, Tuesday or Wednesday with a separate pickup day for recycling at the end of the week.

Trustee Parks stated Ms. Coble had valid points which Staff would consider. He stated there would be issues with once a week pickup, but 80% of the nation had once a week pickup and Broken Arrow would learn to deal with the issues. He stated it may come down to little things such as storing smelly trash in smaller plastic well sealed pouches to reduce the odor.

Vice Chair Eudey stated there would be changes to green waste collection which needed to be considered and discussed. He noted Ms. Coble made valid points and he hoped Ms. Coble would be pleased to hear that her points had been discussed by the Committee and would be addressed. He thanked Ms. Coble for her participation.

Citizen Dawn Seing stated her address was 219 W. Dallas, Broken Arrow. She reported she was a Member of the Citizen's Recycling Committee. She stated GBB did an excellent job reviewing what was discussed during the Committee Meetings. She stated it was important to move forward with curbside recycling and many residents were in full support. She noted there was a small minority who would never approve of any changes. She thanked Ms. Coble for her contribution to the discussion. She indicated extensive discussion had been held regarding green waste. She explained it was not included in the GBB report as the Committee tried to stay focused on whether or not Broken Arrow could feasibly implement a curbside recycling program. She stated the Committee discussed trash pickup extensively. She noted the Committee understood the importance of green waste pickup and there were several excellent options in this regard.

Vice Chair Eudey explained acceptance of the GBB report today simply acknowledged the fact that BAMA had received the report and would further examine and discuss said report. He stated there would be extensive discussion regarding this subject prior to any decision making regarding any program implementation.

MOTION: A motion was made by Johnnie Parks, seconded by Christi Gillespie.

Move to accept the Broken Arrow Pilot Project Report and recommendation of the Citizen Recycle Committee Report and direct Staff to designate a future public meeting
The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Christi Gillespie, Debra Wimpee, Johnnie Parks, Scott Eudey, Craig Thurmond

City Manager Spurgeon asked the BAMA Members to consider the week of October 9, 2019 for the Workshop Meeting.

6. General Authority Business

There was no General Authority Business.

7. Remarks and Updates by City Manager and Staff

City Manager Michael Spurgeon recognized Michael Gordon as the new PSO of External Affairs.

8. Executive Session

There was no Executive Session.

9. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at approximately 8:20 p.m.

MOTION: A motion was made by Johnnie Parks, seconded by Debra Wimpee.

Move to adjourn

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Christi Gillespie, Debra Wimpee, Johnnie Parks, Scott Eudey, Craig Thurmond


Chairman


Secretary

