



City of Broken Arrow
Minutes
Broken Arrow Municipal Authority

City Hall
220 S 1st Street
Broken Arrow OK
74012

Chairperson Craig Thurmond
Vice Chair Scott Eudey
Trustee Johnnie Parks
Trustee Debra Wimpee
Trustee Christi Gillespie

Tuesday, October 15, 2019

Council Chambers

1. Call to Order

Vice Chair Scott Eudey called the meeting to order at approximately 7:12 p.m.

2. Roll Call

Present: 4 - Christi Gillespie, Debra Wimpee, Johnnie Parks, Scott Eudey
Absent: 1 - Craig Thurmond

3. Consideration of Consent Agenda

- A. 19-44 Approval of the Broken Arrow Municipal Authority Meeting Minutes of October 1, 2019**
- B. 19-1271 Acknowledgement of submittal of the Broken Arrow Municipal Authority's Wastewater Discharge Monitoring Report for the month of August 2019**
- C. 19-1264 Acknowledgement of submittal of the Broken Arrow Municipal Authority's Water Supply Report for the month of August 2019**
- D. 19-1282 Approve and authorize execution Amendment No. 2 to the Agreement for Professional Engineering Services for Haikey Creek Operation & Maintenance Capital Equipment Replacements RMUA Project No. WPC 18-2 with Holloway, Updike and Bellen, Inc.**
- E. 19-1246 Award the most advantageous bid to GNC Concrete Products, Inc. for reinforced concrete culvert boxes to GNC Concrete Products, Inc. for the Streets and Stormwater Department**
- F. 19-1267 Award the most advantageous bid to Summit Truck Group for the purchase of one (1) dump truck with a dump body, tow hooks and accessories for the Water Division**
- G. 18-1466 Ratification of the Claims list dated 10/11/2019**

Vice Chair Eudey indicated Item 3F was to be removed for discussion. He asked if there were any other items to be removed from the Consent Agenda. There were none.

MOTION: A motion was made by Johnnie Parks, seconded by Christi Gillespie.

Move to approve the Consent Agenda with the exception of Item 3F

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Christi Gillespie, Debra Wimpee, Johnnie Parks, Scott Eudey

4. Consideration of Items Removed from Consent Agenda

Assistant City Manager Russell Gale reported this Item was on the Consent Agenda. Staff recommended BAMA award the bid to the lowest bidder Summit Truck Group; however, Mr. Josh Rhodes with Premier Truck Group wished to speak with the Authority regarding this Item.

Mr. Josh Rhodes stated his address was 5104 W. 60th Street, Tulsa. He stated he was with

Premier Truck Group who represented Freightliner, the second lowest bidder on this project. He indicated Premier Truck Group (PTG) was the number one commercial chassis supplier to the City of Broken Arrow. He stated Summit Truck Group (who represented International) bid a dump bed price of \$18,200 dollars while Premier Truck Group and Rush Truck Centers bid a dump bed price of \$18,950 dollars. He explained the bids differed by \$750 dollars due to PTG including the requested Allison automatic transmission; this was not included in the Summit bid. He noted the City requested inclusion of an Allison automatic transmission in the bid documents. He stated PTG also bid a \$3,750 dollar option for live load scales which enabled the operators to tell whether the truck was overweight while in the field. He indicated Mr. Lee Zirk felt this was essential for refuse trucks; however, this option could be removed which would lower the bid. He discussed other bid variations and options and noted there was only \$687 dollars difference in bid price which was nominal. He reported Premier Truck Group provided free training to technicians and was available for technical support. He stated he understood the City of Broken Arrow had experienced difficulties with Summit regarding ambulance purchases which had to be retired early due to the ambulances failing to perform properly. He indicated PTG had an excellent relationship with Broken Arrow, provided proven service and products, and there was a very minimal cost difference between the two bids. He asked the Authority to consider awarding the bid to PTG.

Vice Chair Eudey stated he noted Summit Group offered a five year unlimited warranty and PTG offered a two year unlimited warranty. Mr. Rhodes indicated Summit offered a five year unlimited warranty on cab corrosion only; the warranty did not include chassis wiring components. He stated PTG bid an engine which exceeded the City's torque specifications; this was a higher performing engine than the engine bid by Summit.

Mr. Russell Gale indicated the bid tab reflected a \$4,600 dollar difference between the Summit bid and the PTG bid. He asked the Broken Arrow Purchasing Manager, Mr. Patrick Harrison, to review the bid tabs.

Mr. Harrison discussed the bid review and selection process.

Trustee Gillespie stated it sounded as if the bid totals did not compare as "apples to apples" as the Premier Truck Group wrote in an option for \$3,700 dollars. Mr. Harrison agreed, but noted even if this option was removed Summit was still the lowest bidder.

Vice Chair Eudey asked about the bid request for an automatic transmission. Mr. Harrison stated Summit indicated it would fulfill the request for an automatic transmission with its bid. Trustee Gillespie asked about the Allison Transmission. Mr. Harrison responded Allison was a brand of transmission. Assistant City Attorney Slinkard asked if the bid specs specifically requested an Allison Transmission. Mr. Harrison responded in the specs requested a 4,500 RDS transmission which was an Allison Transmission. Ms. Slinkard asked if Summit was providing an Allison 4,500 RDS Transmission. Mr. Harrison responded in the affirmative.

Trustee Gillespie stated it made sense to have the same type of transmission for all fleet trucks. Discussion ensued regarding the transmission, the need for the larger 4,500 transmission, and Rush (the third bidder) failing to meet specs due to the 3,500 RDS transmission.

Trustee Parks asked if Summit truck was in fact the lowest bid which met specifications. Mr. Gale responded in the affirmative. Trustee Parks stated if this was the case the Authority was required to award the bid to Summit. He asked if this was correct. Ms. Slinkard responded in the affirmative; the Authority was required to award the bid to the

lowest and most advantageous bid. She explained unless there was a valid reason why the lowest bidder was not the most advantageous bidder, the lowest bidder would be awarded the bid. Vice Chair Eudey asked if there was any reason why the lowest bid in this case would not be advantageous to the City. Ms. Slinkard responded in the negative; however, due to the past difficulties with Summit ambulances this Item could be tabled and the Legal Department and Staff could research the situation. Vice Chair Eudey stated this was his biggest concern; if the City had troubles with a provider it should be considered in future agreements.

Mr. Gale asked if Broken Arrow currently used Summit Truck Group (International brand) vehicles. The Fleet Manager, Mr. Mike Bradley, responded in the affirmative. Mr. Gale asked if these vehicles were problematic. Mr. Bradley responded in the affirmative; the International brand trucks were extremely problematic. He explained the electrical systems were terrible in these vehicles. Ms. Slinkard recommended tabling this Item. She stated she would meet with the Fleet Manager, Purchasing Manager and Mr. Lee Zirk to determine which bid was in fact most advantageous.

Vice Chair Eudey stated he agreed, generally speaking, the lowest bid became the most advantageous bid and the Authority had no choice but to award the lowest bidder; however, it was important to take into consideration the quality of a product as well. He agreed the Item should be tabled to enable Ms. Slinkard and Staff to fully research the situation.

MOTION: A motion was made by Johnnie Parks, seconded by Debra Wimpee.

Move to table Item 3F

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Christi Gillespie, Debra Wimpee, Johnnie Parks, Scott Eudey

5. Public Hearings, Appeals, Presentations, Recognitions, Awards

There were no Public Hearings, Appeals, Presentations, Recognitions or Awards.

6. General Authority Business

There was no General Authority Business.

7. Remarks and Updates by City Manager and Staff

There were no Remarks and Updates by City Manager and Staff.

8. Executive Session

There was no Executive Session.

9. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at approximately 7:27 p.m.

MOTION: A motion was made by Christi Gillespie, seconded by Debra Wimpee.

Move to adjourn

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Christi Gillespie, Debra Wimpee, Johnnie Parks, Scott Eudey

Chairman

Secretary